



November | 2014

'No Space to Breathe'- Spaces of Worship
as 'Generators' of Social Cohesion

Dr. Igor Cherstich – SOAS

CONTENTS

Introduction	2
Festivals of Devotion and Socialisation (“Zawaya” and “Mazarat”)	5
Space, Music and Social Cohesion	8
Salafism and the attacks to the Shrines	12
Conclusion	14
Bibliography	15

1. Introduction:

From a socio-anthropological point of view, ‘worshipping’ is not simply the individualistic search for a relationship with the divine. Quite differently, ‘worshipping’ is a ‘social action’: an act that presupposes a community and, consequently, a sense of common identity. As famously noticed by the father of sociology Emile Durkheim,¹ even the solitary mystic prays using formulas and gestures that come from the tradition of a community: even in the case of the hermit the act of worshipping is inherently social. Bearing this in mind, it is interesting to notice that when it comes to worship ‘sociality’ is deeply linked with ‘spatiality’. As human beings we live by moving in space,² and it is by interacting with each other in space that we create our sense of common identity and belonging. From this perspective, a space of worship is far more than a place of ritual performance.

As anthropologists have often pointed out, mosques, churches, temples or synagogues are not simply places of sanctuary and liturgy.³ Rather, they are a faith community’s main arena of meeting: contexts where identity is forged through social interaction. A space of worship stands as a location wherein specific social practices are manifested and catalysed. Religious poetry and musical traditions have come to be born and nurtured precisely due to these locations. Through these forms of expression a community comes together. In light of these considerations, this paper will address a specific aspect of the relationship between space, worship and identity. More specifically, this paper will attempt to answer the question of *what does destruction of a space of worship mean for a faith community?*

*

If it is true that a space of worship is the place where identity is created, then an act of destruction perpetrated against such a space is not merely an attack against an historical/architectonic heritage. Instead, such acts of violence should be analysed as a threat to the deepest social fabric of a specific

¹ Durkheim 1956:10

² Lefebvre 1991; Bachelard 1997

³ Marsden 2005; Mittermaier 2008

human group. Rather than as ‘violence against things’ these actions should be considered as ‘violence against people’, because they deprive a community of the space where their identity is created. In order to elucidate this point, one has to show how identity is forged and reinforced in a space of worship. In other words, one has to appreciate the dynamics of identity-creation in space in order to understand the real consequences of violence performed against places of worship.

In typical anthropological fashion, the best way to do so is to concentrate on specific case-studies. In the past couple of years, for instance, the Muslim world has seen an unprecedented number of attacks on spaces of worship, and in particular attacks against places that are linked with Sufi Islam. Sufism (in Arabic “*tasawwuf*”) is generally understood to be the mystical dimension of Islam, but it is also a highly complex phenomenon that has taken different shapes and forms throughout history.⁴ In the Muslim world Sufism is mainly organised into “*turuq*” (sing. “*tariqa*”, “ways”), brotherhoods or orders that are characterised by specific rituals and practices. Sufi contexts are often characterised by the presence of *adriah* (sing. *darih*): buildings of different shapes and forms (from small cubic buildings to much larger domed constructions) that host the tombs of famous Sufi saints of the past. Recently, Salafi⁵ groups - a branch of Islam traditionally antithetic to Sufism – have expressed their anti-Sufi stance through acts of violence against these places. Libya is one of the countries where such acts of destruction have taken place.

Libya

There are eleven different Sufi orders in Libya, and many of them have played an important role in Libyan society and history. The powerful Libyan order of the *Sanusiya*, for instance, has attracted

⁴ Detailed accounts of the historical and doctrinal aspects of Sufism can be found in Nicholson 1963; Schimmel 1994; Burckhardt 1976; Trimingham 1998.

⁵ Salafism’ (from *Salafi* - “predecessor”) is a Sunni school of thought that takes the first three generations of Muslims of early Islam (Mohammed’s companions, their successors, and the successors’ successors) as exemplary models. *Salafi* Islam encompasses a series of different groups but it is generally characterised by a literalistic interpretation of the *Qur’an*, and by a strong antipathy towards Sufism (either in its entirety or in some of its manifestations) Nagata 2001; Roy 2002; Devji 2005.

the attention of scholars and colonial observers due to its fundamental role in the anti-colonial struggle against the Italian invaders in the first decades of the twentieth century.⁶ For centuries Libyan Sufi shrines have been the object of worship by pilgrims and pious travellers. Recently, however, these spaces of worship have become the object of a ferocious religious violence. As reported by the world media,⁷ Libyan Salafi groups are experiencing a revival in the post-Qaddafi phase: once repressed by the regime, Salafis are now pushing to take part in Libyan political life, but they are also attacking Sufi shrines and expressing their desire to free Libya from what they perceive to be a heretical approach to religion.

By analysing the case study of Libya, I will attempt to shed light on the relationship between space of worship and identity. In this paper I will draw from my experience gained from field-work⁸ and I will present an overview of the social relevance of the Sufi shrines in Libya, paying particular attention to the importance of these buildings in the city of Tripoli.

More specifically, I will concentrate on the festivals organised around these places of worship. In doing so I will show how identity (and, more specifically, social cohesion) is forged in these places through the performance of a specific social praxis. In particular, I will explore the role of music as a social practice which is inherently linked to Sufi festivals and to Sufi shrines, and as a social action that shapes the dynamics of identity formation in the Libyan context. Rather than proposing an analysis which is valid only for Libya, I will put forward a series of considerations that are applicable to many other contexts. The analysis of this specific case-study will help me to highlight the role of places of worship as ‘generators’ of identity, and to identify the acts of destruction performed against such places as true threats to society.

⁶ Evans-Pritchard 1949; Ziadeh 1958; Triaud 1995, 1995b; Vikor 1995, 1996

⁷ “Sufi Shrines blown up in latest religious attack in Libya”, Reuters 29th March 2013 (accessed on the 30th of July 2013) <http://blogs.reuters.com/faithworld/2013/03/29/sufi-shrine-blown-up-in-latest-religious-attack-in-libya/>; “Libya: Stop attacks on Sufi Sites”, Human Rights Watch 31st August 2012 (accessed on the 28th of July 2013) <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/08/31/libya-stop-attacks-sufi-sites>

⁸ I have conducted an extensive fifteen months ethnographic field-work in the country between 2006 and 2008 as part of my PhD in Social Anthropology. Prior to this I had visited Libya three times in 2002 and in 2003. I have also come back to Libya for a short visit in February 2012, after the revolution.

2. Festivals of Devotion and Socialisation (“Zawaya” and “Mazarat”)

Very often one is tempted to think of places of worship as exclusive spaces that create divisions within a human group. Religious gatherings are often seen as occasions whose access is open only to a specific portion of society (the baptised, the pious, the initiated, the members of a specific brotherhood, order or religious branch etc.). However, ethnographic studies have shown that religious meetings can be very inclusive events that bring together different groups of people in an atmosphere of social cohesion and entertainment (as well as of piety and devotion).⁹

Scholars of religion have generally emphasised the devotional character of these events,¹⁰ identifying processes of sacralisation of locality. Nevertheless, recent publications have also stressed the importance of the entertaining aspect of these events, explaining how religious festivals can be occasions of leisure and playfulness, and that due to their playful nature these occasions attract different strata of society.¹¹ This is certainly true for Sufi festivals organised in the shrines of the Tripoli district. The importance of saints’ festivals for specific tribal groups has already been documented in North-Africa.¹² Nonetheless, in Tripoli (and indeed in Libya in general) Sufi festivals are crowded events whose participation is open to Sufis as well as to people who have no particular interest in Sufi affairs.

First of all, it is important to clarify that the Sufi shrines are not simply spaces of occasional devotion. On the contrary, in Tripoli (as in many other Muslim contexts), the members of the Sufi orders meet in the shrines in order to practice their rituals on a weekly basis. In Libya a Sufi gathering place is referred to with the term ‘*zawiya*’ (pl. *zawaya*). A *zawiya* is usually a simple building (often built in the proximity of a mosque), with a large main room. Some *zawaya* have also a kitchen and a storeroom. In the proximity of a *zawiya* or inside it you can often find the tomb of a

⁹ Gilsenan: 1973: 62.

¹⁰ Hoffman 1995: 101-122

¹¹ Coulon 1999: 196; Schielke 2006: 119-120

¹² Peters 1976; Eickelman 1981

saint, usually one that is related to a specific Sufi brotherhood (either because of a special devotion or because the saint was a member of the order). Some *zawaya* are therefore also shrines, while others are not. *Zawaya* have different names but each time a *zawiya*'s name starts with “*Sidhi*”¹³ you can assume there is a saint buried nearby. *Zawaya* are places of Sufi devotion, but in particular moments of the year these spaces of worship become all-inclusive contexts of playfulness and entertainment whose social appeal goes beyond Sufism.

The term “*mazar*” literally means “*place of visitation*” and in many Islamic contexts it indicates the shrine of a saint.¹⁴ In Libya however the term does not refer to a place, but to an occurrence. “*Mazar*” is a word that can be used in the broader sense of religious gathering, but also to indicate a festival held in honour of a saint, usually in the proximity of a Sufi shrine. A Libyan *mazar* is a devout occasion for many: attendees come to pay a visit to the tomb of the saint, sitting close to the shrine in contemplation. However, often the shrine is just an element of the scene, and not necessarily the most important. Frequently, people are only able to produce poor accounts of the life of the saint who is celebrated, and very often they admittedly come to the *mazarat* only to meet other people and have fun.

Generally speaking, Libyan festivals are very small events that lack the general vivaciousness that characterises the veneration of shrines in other ethnographic contexts.¹⁵ Yet, Libyan *mazarat* remain highly sociable occasions where people come to eat, talk and enjoy a cup of tea. Both Sufi enthusiasts and people who have no interest in Sufi matters whatsoever come to take part to these events. Attendees sit on mats on the ground, while the people who take care of the event carry trays transporting small cups of tea (which they pour from above, causing a thin layer of froth which is much appreciated). Carbonated soft drinks are ever-present. Dinner is always served, usually after

¹³ Short for Sayyed, a title that indicates a descendant of the prophet Mohammed, a saintly figure or a particularly important person.

¹⁴ Lemercier-Quelquejay 1996:306; Gaborieu 1996: 207

¹⁵ Gilsenan 1973: 50

the sunset prayer. The menu can include fruits, sweets, couscous, rice, and pasta. *Mazarat* are inherently occasions of strong interaction and socialisation.

The duration of these festivals can vary greatly, and the dates in which they start might be slightly different every year. Usually, when it comes to ancient saints, the dates are determined according to the Islamic calendar, as in the case of medieval saint *Sidhi el Andalusi* whose shrine hosts the longest *mazar* in Tripoli that lasts for a week. However, festivals that commemorate more recent saints generally follow the Western calendar, as for the popular festival of *Sidhi Ali Budabus* celebrated in the area of *Jamzur*, just outside Tripoli, every 12 July in remembrance of the day of his death in 1999. Since Sufi *zawaya* are often built close to - or directly on - the tomb of a saint, sometimes the *mazar* is organised by the members of the *zawiya* that hosts the shrine. Other times, however, the festival is put together by people from the local neighbourhood who might not have anything to do with a Sufi order. There are festivals where people who have an interest in Sufism are more likely to participate either because the saint that is celebrated was the member of a Sufi order or because the *mazar* is organised by a particularly popular *Sufi zawiya*. In Tripoli, for instance, members of the brotherhood tend to gather every year in the suburb of *Tajura* to celebrate a *mazar* at the shrine of *Sidhi Ali Jundub*- an influential *Sufi master* who died in 1978. Popular amongst Tripolitan Sufis are also the *mazarat* held in honour of *Sidhi al Mazri* and *Sidhi al Kittani*, which are organised by the members of two very important *zawaya* that are named after these two saints. Generally speaking, however, the orders constitute only a portion (often not the largest) of the attendees. Interestingly, the majority of the people who come to participate in the *mazarat* are attracted to specific musical performances that characterise the festivals.

3. Space, Music and Social Cohesion

Very often, music plays an extremely important role in the relationship between identity and places of worship. This is true for secular settings as well as for religious ones. In many contexts, specific musical genres are deeply linked to specific places and occasions (traditional songs played in honour of a saint in a patronal feast, or even football chants screamed by football fans for the occasion of a particularly important match). Through music a community expresses specific cultural themes and motifs, re-enforcing its identity.

However, it would be wrong to analyse music's capacity for social cohesion by concentrating only on the message of music.¹⁶ Rather, anthropologists have noticed that it is often the playful and entertaining dimension of music that contributes to reinforce social ties between people.¹⁷ This is particularly true for what concerns the Sufi festivals since these are occasions where a specific form of music called *Mal'uf* is performed. Even though Libya has a variety of regional musical traditions, *Mal'uf* music has a central place in the soundscape of the country, particularly in Western Libya. *Mal'uf* ("familiar", "popular") is a melodious genre of music which was imported to North-Africa from Andalusia at the time of the Moorish caliphates in the Hispanic peninsula.¹⁸

Historically speaking, *Mal'uf* has a strong Sufi connotation, since many of the songs performed in the *zawaya* are either adaptations of Sufi poems of the past or lyrical compositions in praise of Sufi saints. However, because it is also an extremely fashionable genre of music, the *zawaya* attract a large amount of people who have no interest in Sufi affairs. Apart from being performed in a number of social situations including weddings,¹⁹ *Mal'uf* is one of the most popular choices when it comes to select music for a car-journey, or to fill up the track list of an MP3 player. In Tripoli some Tripolitan *zawaya* have a particularly good reputation for their *Mal'uf*, attracting therefore both

¹⁶ Qureshi 2000

¹⁷ Wolf 2001

¹⁸ *Mal'uf* belongs to a complex musicological family that counts a number of orally transmitted local variations in the whole of North-Africa. The genre seems to have arrived in Maghreb with Muslims and Jews escaping the Spanish *reconquista* of Andalusia (Davis 1997:3; Ciantar 2006:58).

¹⁹ In Tripolitania *Mal'uf* is played in the course of the *zaffa*, the singing procession that accompanies the groom during the wedding (Ciantar 2006: 60).

Mal'uf connoisseurs and fans. Because of the music, the *zawaya* attract people of different ages and social statuses who listen to *Mal'uf* in their recreational time, and this explains why even Libyans who do not identify with Sufism visit the *zawaya* during the saints' festivals

In the *zawaya* *Mal'uf* is played in a ritual context. One of the most recognisable components of the festivals is the *hadhra*: a well-known ritual in the literature on Sufism that involves pious recitations, physical movements and music. The term ("*hadhra*", "presence") assumes different connotations in the various Sufi traditions but in Libya it indicates the state of mind of the attendees, who come to the ritual to 'be present': to elevate their soul in praise of the almighty. Libyan Sufis perform the *hadhra* in the evening, right before the end of a festival, usually as a ritual in three parts.

In the first part the attendees recite the "*hezb*" a litany that invokes the blessing of God over the attendees. Secondly, to use a term that can be ubiquitously found in studies on Sufism, the attendees perform the *dhikr*, the "*remembrance (of God)*": a prolonged invocation of the ninety-nine attributes that Islam traditionally ascribes to Allah.²⁰ The third part, is the *fen* ("*art*"): the performance of *Mal'uf* music. Interestingly, everyone is invited to take part in the ritual, both Sufis and non-Sufis. The attendees are of different ages and they often belong to very different strata of Libyan society. I have seen lawyers, shop-keepers, religious people, people critical of religion and many others coming and taking part in similar occasions.

Many consider the *dhikr* and the *fen* as the two most important parts of the *hadhra*, mainly because they are both characterised by the presence of music. A *dhikr* session is a continuous succession of different or improvised devout formulas. However, throughout the entire ceremony a group of attendees sing a series of *Mal'uf* pieces in order to create a counter-tempo with the recitation of the formulas. The intensity of the ritual grows exponentially. The attendees follow the music, swaying

²⁰ For a broader contextualisation on the divine attributes in Sufi philosophy see Frank 2009.

from right to left, and after a while the formulas are shortened in order to keep up with the movements. As the ritual gains sonic potency, there is always someone who moves forward leaving the circle, waving his hands with his eyes closed, in trance. Trance (“*jedheb*”, “*being taken*”) is quite common, amongst both Sufis and occasional attendees. Often someone who has not stepped inside a *zawiya* for years might come and spend a large portion of the *fen* waving his hands in ecstasy and screaming out unarticulated sounds of joy. When the *hadhra* reaches this point, it is an emotional detonation. In some *zawaya* all lights are switched off. Large portions of the attendees are free to go to trance, and then slowly the ritual comes to an end. People take a break and grab a cup of tea, while things are set for the third part of the *hadhra*: the musical performance, or *fen*.

At the beginning of the *fen* a group of amateur musicians that is summoned for the occasion (which can include both Sufis and people who do not usually frequent the *zawaya*) gathers on one side of the *zawiya*. The rest of the attendees occupy the space of the *zawiya* sitting dispersed on the floor, or in small groups. The melody is always provided by communal singing. The music is called “*Mal’uf*”, “*familiar*”- and perhaps not by chance. It is very rare to find an attendee who does not know at least part of the lyrics by heart, and this testifies to the capacity for social cohesion which is inherent in *Mal’uf* music. Generally speaking, the quantity of attendees who participate in the first part of the *hadhra* might not be very high, but when the *fen* is played the number grows considerably, and at this point of the performance a Tripolitan *zawiya* can easily host some two hundred people of different ages, backgrounds and social statuses.

The *fen* is divided into different sections or *nawbat* (sing. *nawba*). Sometimes, a *fen*-session can last until the early hours of the morning, involving a number of *nawbat*. Generally speaking, *Mal’uf* is divided into *Mal’uf el madah* (“*Mal’uf of praise*”) including songs of religious content, and *Mal’uf el ghazal* (“*Mal’uf of courtship*”) whose lyrics are centred on love with no explicit spiritual connotation. The Sufi temperament of the music can be detected particularly in this second type

that, following well-documented literary conventions of Sufi poetry,²¹ presents references to romance, drunkenness, and wine. These are supposed to be metaphors of the passionate love the Sufi has for God and the Prophet: a love that can bring the mystic to spiritual intoxication. Trance behaviour is also very common during the *fen* amongst both Sufis and non-Sufis. Some simply follow the rhythm of the *Mal'uf*, while others – particularly when the song of choice has a vibrant tempo - fall into a vivacious dance. The *fen* is a joyful, animated and jubilant moment. Sometimes the drum players allow themselves a short drum solo during the performance, and the emphasis is so strong that often they break the skins of their drums. When the music stops the *hadhra* is over. The *hadhra* contributes to make the festivals important social occasions that bring people from different walks of life together. This important social role, however, has been undermined by recent acts of violence.

²¹ Schimmel 1982; Nurbakhsh 1984: 143.

4. Salafism and the attacks to the Shrines

Salafism has been present in Libya for some three decades, but it is in the past couple of years that Salafis have become particularly active. In the late eighties a series of different Salafi-inspired organisations started to spread in the country. Preoccupied with the political agenda of some of these ‘Islamist’ groups, the Qaddafi regime decided to eradicate Salafism: during the eighties and nineties several thousands of Salafi activists were arrested and executed. With the fall of the regime in 2011,²² however, these groups have now become free to operate. Salafis have started to attack not only the Sufi shrines but also the Sufis themselves. Important Tripolitan shrines like *Sidhi el Kittani* and *Sidhi el Mazri* have been almost entirely destroyed, while many Sufi masters have received death threats.

In the area of Beni Walid, a few kilometres west of Tripoli, the shrines have been desecrated with Salafis writing profanities on the tombs and destroying the bodily remains of the Sufi saints. The situation is exacerbated by the fact that since 2011 many Salafis have organised themselves into armed militias.²³ During his forty years in power Qaddafi had managed to have direct control not only over the national army but also over the police force. With the fall of the regime this apparatus has obviously collapsed. Meanwhile, in many areas of the country (including Tripoli) Salafi militias are practically free to persecute the Sufis and attack the shrines, while Libya is slowly losing an important tradition that has helped keeping different strata of society together for decades.

As I have shown, the shrines are not simply a static part of the Libyan landscape. On the contrary they bear a dynamic social significance for the country. The saints’ festivals are not simply occasions of devotion, but also important moments of socialisation and entertainment. Bearing this in mind, the Libyan case becomes an important conundrum for an understanding of the link between spaces of worship, identity and social cohesion. More specifically, an analysis of this case

²² Chorin 2013

²³ “Militias become Power Centres in Libya”, *The progressive*, September 2012 (accessed on the 31st of July 2013), http://progressive.org/libya_militias.html

helps us understand that acts of destruction performed against such spaces are effectively acts of violence against a society.

The Salafi attacks have had an impact on Libya's political life. In August 2012, for instance, the interior minister, Fawzi Abdellahi, resigned in protest at criticism from others in government over his failed handling of the violence.²⁴ More importantly, the attacks have had a deep social impact. Sufis (and people who do not belong to the orders but are close to Sufism) are slowly reducing their activities in the *zawaya*, and in recent interviews many Tripolitans told me that they refuse to participate to the festivals because they are scared of repercussions from the Salafis. The same people also told me that Salafism is quickly acquiring followers in Tripoli, and that many Salafis openly preach the need to persecute Muslims who do not conform to their understanding of correct religiosity. The acts of destruction perpetrated against the shrines are therefore exacerbating fear and social divisions within the Libyan community. This is particularly worrying when bearing in mind that after the fall of the pluri-decennial regime of Qaddafi social cohesion is of vital importance to ensure stability in the new Libya.

²⁴ "Religious Violence in Libya: Who is to Blame?", Huffington Post, 12th May 2012 (accessed 27th July 2013) http://www.huffingtonpost.com/igor-cherstich/religious-violence-in-lib_b_2245265.html

Conclusion:

Libya is one of many contexts which are experiencing religious violence perpetrated through acts of destruction on spaces of worship. An analysis of this case shows that the relationship between identity and spaces of worship is particularly deep, because such places host specific social practices that help sustain cohesion within a group.

External observers often look at acts of destruction performed against these spaces through an ‘archaeological bias’: they consider places of worship simply as ‘heritage’, ‘religious architecture’, ‘material history’, forgetting that these places are, in a sense, ‘alive’.

Doubtlessly, these places have an historical dimension and often represent a trace of the past which has managed to survive in the present. It is important to remember, however, that places of worship constitute a privileged vehicle for identity-making. They are dynamic social realities rather than static pieces of history. Depriving a community of such spaces means weakening the unity of a society, and exposing a specific human group to division and fragmentation. In order to understand the consequences of similar acts of destruction we need to change our perspective. Rather than treating these episodes as crimes against cultural heritage we should look at them as violence against people and as threats for the identity of a group. Applying this perspective is absolutely crucial if one wants to understand what happens when violence enters the complex equation that links space, identity and social practices together.

Bibliography:

- Bachelard, G.** 1997, "Poetics of Space", in *Rethinking Architecture - A Reader in Cultural Theory*, N. Leach (Ed.), 86-100. London: Routledge
- Burkhardt, T.** 1976. *An Introduction to Sufi doctrine*. Wellingborough: Thorsons.
- Chorin, E.** 2013 *Exit the Colonel: the Hidden History of the Libyan Revolution*. London: Perseus
- Ciantar, P.** 2006, "Nostalgia, History and Sheikhs in the Libyan Mal'uf: listening Contexts in the Shadows of the Past", In *Muwashshah – proceedings of the Conference on Arabic and Hebrew Strophic Poetry and its Romance Parallels, School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), London, 8-10 October 2004*, E. Emery (Ed), 55 – 69. London: the Print Room, School of Oriental and African Studies.
- Coulon, C.** 1999 "The Grand Magal in Touba: a Religious Festival of the Mouride Brotherhoods of Senegal", In *African Affairs*, 98, 195-210. Oxford University Press.
- Davis, R.** 1997 "Cultural Policy and the Tunisian Mal'uf: Redefining a Tradition", In *Ethnomusicology*, 41, 1, 1 - 21. Champaign: University of Illinois Press.
- Devji, F.** 2005 *Landscapes of the Jihad – Militancy, Morality, Modernity*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Dhurkeim, E.** 1956 *Les Règles de la Méthode Sociologique*. Paris : Presses Universitaires de France
- Eickelman, D.** 1981 *Moroccan Islam: Tradition and Society in a Pilgrimage Centre*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Evans-Pritchard, E.E.** 1949 *The Sanusi of Cyrenaica*. Oxford: Oxford at the Clarendon Press.
- Frank, G.** 2009 *Al-Ghazali Philosophical Theology*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Gaborieau, M.** 1996 "Les Modes d'Organization", In *Les Voies D'Allah – Les ordres mystique dans L'Islam des origines à aujourd'hui*, A. Popovic & G. Veinstein (Eds.), 205-212. France: Fayard.
- Gilsenan, M.** 1973 *Saint and Sufi in Modern Egypt – An essay in the Sociology of Religion*. Oxford: Oxford at the Clarendon Press.
- Hoffman, V.J.** 1995 *Sufism, Mystics and Saints in Modern Egypt*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.
- Lefebvre, H.** 1991 *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Lemercier- Quelquejray, C.** 1996 "Le Caucase", In *Les Voies D'Allah – Les ordres mystique dans L'Islam des origines à aujourd'hui*, A. Popovic & G. Veinstein (Eds.), 300-308. France: Fayard.

- Marsden, M.** 2005 *Living Islam: Muslim Religious Experience in Pakistan's North-West Frontier*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mittermaier, A.** 2008 "(Re) imagining Space: Dreams and Saint Shrines in Egypt", In *Dimensions of Locality, Muslim Saints, their Place and Space - Yearbook of the Sociology of Islam 8*, G. Stauth & S.Schielke (Eds.), 47 -66. Transcript: Bielefeld.
- Nagata, J.** 2001 "Beyond Theology: Toward an Anthropology of Fundamentalism", In *American Anthropologist, New Series*, 103, 2, 481-498.
- Nicholson, R.A.** 1963. *The Mystics of Islam*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Nurbakhsh, F.** 1984 *Sufi Symbolism*. Khaniqahi-Nimatullahi Publications.
- Peters, E.L.** 1976 "From Particularism to Universalism in the Religion of the Cyrenaican Bedouin", In *Bulletin – British Society for Middle-Eastern Studies*, 3, 1, 5-14.
- Qureshi, R.** 2000 "How does Music mean? Embodied Memories and the Politics of Affect in the Indian Sarangi", In *American Ethnologist*, 27, 4, 805 – 838. Blackwell Publishing.
- Roy, O.** 2002 *Globalised Islam – The Search for a New Ummah*. London: Hurst & Company
- Schielke, S.** 2006, "On Snacks and Saints: When Discourses of Rationality and Order enter the Egyptian Mawlid", In *Archives de Sciences Sociales des Religions*, 135, 116-139.
- Schimmel, A.** 1994 *Deciphering the Signs of God : a Phenomenological approach to Islam*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Schimmel, A.** 1982 *As Through a Veil – Mystical Poetry in Islam*. Columbia University Press: New York.
- Triaud J.L.** 1995 *La Legende Noire de la Sanusiyya – Une Confrerie Musulmane Saharienne sous le regard Français (1840-1930)*. Vol.I, Paris: Editions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme.
- Triaud J.L.** 1995b *La Legende Noire de la Sanusiyya – Une Confrerie Musulmane Saharienne sous le regard Français (1840-1930)*. Vol.II, Paris: Editions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme.
- Trimingham, J.S.** 1998 *The Sufi orders in Islam*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Vikor, K.** 1996 *Sources for Sanusi Studies*. Bergen: Centre for Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies
- Vikor, K.** 1995 *Sufi and Scholar on the Desert Edge, Muhammad b. Ali al-Sanusi and his Brotherhood*. London: Hurst & Company.
- Wolf, R.** 2001 "Emotional Dimensions of Ritual Music among the Kotas, a South Indian Tribe", In *Ethnomusicology*, 45, 3, 379-422
- Ziadeh, N.A** 1958 *Sanusiyah: a study of a revivalist movement in Islam*. Leiden: Brill.